

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

CIVIL ACTION NUMBER:

IN RE: VALSARTAN PRODUCTS  
LIABILITY LITIGATION

19-md-02875  
TELEPHONIC CASE MANAGEMENT  
CONFERENCE

Mitchell H. Cohen Building & U.S. Courthouse  
4th & Cooper Streets  
Camden, New Jersey 08101  
February 28, 2023  
Commencing at 1:01 p.m.

B E F O R E: THE HONORABLE ROBERT B. KUGLER  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

A P P E A R A N C E S:

MAZIE SLATER KATZ & FREEMAN, LLC  
BY: ADAM M. SLATER, ESQUIRE  
103 Eisenhower Parkway  
Roseland, New Jersey 07068  
For the Plaintiffs

SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER & FLOM LLP  
BY: JESSICA DAVIDSON, ESQUIRE  
1440 New York Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20005  
For the Defendants, Princeton Pharmaceuticals,  
Solco Healthcare U.S. LLC, and Zhejiang Huahai  
Pharmaceuticals Ltd.

Ann Marie Mitchell, Official Court Reporter  
AnnMarie\_Mitchell@njd.uscourts.gov  
(856) 576-7018

Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography; transcript  
produced by computer-aided transcription.

1     A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued):

2  
3           GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP  
4           BY: STEVEN M. HARKINS, ESQUIRE  
5           3333 Piedmont Road, NE, Suite 2500  
6           Atlanta, Georgia 30305  
7           For the Defendants, Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.,  
8           Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Actavis LLC,  
9           and Actavis Pharma, Inc.

10        ALSO PRESENT:

11  
12           LORETTA SMITH, ESQUIRE  
13           Judicial Law Clerk to The Honorable Robert B. Kugler  
14           Larry MacStravic, Courtroom Deputy

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

(PROCEEDINGS held telephonically before The Honorable  
ROBERT B. KUGLER at 1:01 p.m.)

3 THE COURT: Good afternoon, it's Judge Kugler.

4 Is everybody on?

5 RESPONSE: Good afternoon.

6 THE COURT: I got a letter February 24th from defense  
7 counsel, Ms. Davidson, about -- apparently there's only one  
8 matter, the Greene matter, still to be dismissed. Correct?

9 MR. HARKINS: Good afternoon, Your Honor. This is  
10 Steve Harkins for the joint defense group with Greenberg  
11 Traurig.

12 And yes, that's correct, just the Greene matter. And  
13 we'll resume listing additional cases for the pending orders  
14 to show cause and our standard tables on the agenda next  
15 month.

16 THE COURT: The Lewis and Willis matters and the  
17 Barone matter have been resolved, so we'll dismiss the order  
18 to show cause.

19 And you want to carry the Barber, Knudson, Balay,  
20 ballet, B-A-L-A-Y, and Czajkowski to the next one, so that  
21 leaves Greene.

22 Is anyone speaking on behalf of Elie or Elie,  
23 E-L-I-E, Greene?

24 (No response.)

THE COURT: Well, then your application to dismiss is

1 granted. We'll dismiss that case.

2 That's all we have as far as I know on the agenda  
3 today. Correct?

4 MR. SLATER: I believe so.

5 MR. HARKINS: Nothing for defendants, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: I see we've got the defendants' motion to  
7 stay, so I'm looking forward to reading those papers. And the  
8 plaintiffs, I'm sure they'll oppose that. So we'll go from  
9 there. Okay?

10 MR. SLATER: Yes.

11 THE COURT: Anything else?

12 MR. SLATER: I don't think there's anything else for  
13 plaintiffs, Your Honor.

14 MS. DAVIDSON HARKINS: Nothing for defendants, Your  
15 Honor.

16 THE COURT: All right. Thank you, everybody. We'll  
17 talk to you in a couple of weeks.

18 (Proceedings concluded at 1:04 p.m.)

19 - - -

20 I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript  
21 from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter.

22

23 /S/ Ann Marie Mitchell, CCR, CRR, RDR, RMR  
24 Court Reporter/Transcriber

25 28th day of February, 2023  
Date

|  |  |  |   |
|--|--|--|---|
| <p><b>/</b></p> <p><b>S</b> [1] - 4:23</p> <p><b>0</b></p> <p><b>07068</b> [1] - 1:14<br/><b>08101</b> [1] - 1:8</p> <p><b>1</b></p> <p><b>103</b> [1] - 1:14<br/><b>1440</b> [1] - 1:17<br/><b>19-md-02875</b> [1] - 1:4<br/><b>1:01</b> [2] - 1:9, 3:2<br/><b>1:04</b> [1] - 4:18</p> <p><b>2</b></p> <p><b>20005</b> [1] - 1:18<br/><b>2023</b> [2] - 1:8, 4:24<br/><b>24th</b> [1] - 3:6<br/><b>2500</b> [1] - 2:3<br/><b>28</b> [1] - 1:8<br/><b>28th</b> [1] - 4:24</p> <p><b>3</b></p> <p><b>30305</b> [1] - 2:4<br/><b>3333</b> [1] - 2:3</p> <p><b>4</b></p> <p><b>4th</b> [1] - 1:7</p> <p><b>5</b></p> <p><b>576-7018</b> [1] - 1:23</p> <p><b>8</b></p> <p><b>856</b> [1] - 1:23</p> <p><b>A</b></p> <p><b>above-entitled</b> [1] - 4:21<br/><b>Actavis</b> [2] - 2:5, 2:5<br/><b>ACTION</b> [1] - 1:3<br/><b>ADAM</b> [1] - 1:13<br/><b>additional</b> [1] - 3:13<br/><b>afternoon</b> [3] - 3:3, 3:5, 3:9<br/><b>agenda</b> [2] - 3:14, 4:2<br/><b>aided</b> [1] - 1:24<br/><b>ALSO</b> [1] - 2:7<br/><b>Ann</b> [1] - 4:23<br/><b>ann</b> [1] - 1:22<br/><b>AnnMarie_Mitchell@njd.uscourts.gov</b> [1] - 1:22<br/><b>application</b> [1] - 3:25<br/><b>ARPS</b> [1] - 1:16<br/><b>Atlanta</b> [1] - 2:4</p> | <p><b>Avenue</b> [1] - 1:17</p> <p><b>B</b></p> <p><b>Balay</b> [1] - 3:19<br/><b>BALAY</b> [1] - 3:20<br/><b>ballet</b> [1] - 3:20<br/><b>Barber</b> [1] - 3:19<br/><b>Barone</b> [1] - 3:17<br/><b>behalf</b> [1] - 3:22<br/><b>Building</b> [1] - 1:7</p> <p><b>C</b></p> <p><b>Camden</b> [1] - 1:8<br/><b>carry</b> [1] - 3:19<br/><b>CASE</b> [1] - 1:5<br/><b>case</b> [1] - 4:1<br/><b>cases</b> [1] - 3:13<br/><b>CCR</b> [1] - 4:23<br/><b>certify</b> [1] - 4:20<br/><b>CIVIL</b> [1] - 1:3<br/><b>Clerk</b> [1] - 2:9<br/><b>Cohen</b> [1] - 1:7<br/><b>Commencing</b> [1] - 1:9<br/><b>computer</b> [1] - 1:24<br/><b>computer-aided</b> [1] - 1:24<br/><b>concluded</b> [1] - 4:18<br/><b>CONFERENCE</b> [1] - 1:5<br/><b>Continued</b> [1] - 2:1<br/><b>Cooper</b> [1] - 1:7<br/><b>correct</b> [4] - 3:8, 3:12, 4:3, 4:20<br/><b>counsel</b> [1] - 3:7<br/><b>couple</b> [1] - 4:17<br/><b>Court</b> [2] - 1:22, 4:23<br/><b>COURT</b> [1] - 1:1<br/><b>Courthouse</b> [1] - 1:7<br/><b>Courtroom</b> [1] - 2:10<br/><b>CRR</b> [1] - 4:23<br/><b>Czajkowski</b> [1] - 3:20</p> <p><b>D</b></p> <p><b>Date</b> [1] - 4:25<br/><b>DAVIDSON</b> [2] - 1:17, 4:14<br/><b>Davidson</b> [1] - 3:7<br/><b>DC</b> [1] - 1:18<br/><b>defendants</b> [2] - 4:5, 4:14<br/><b>Defendants</b> [2] - 1:18, 2:4<br/><b>defendants'</b> [1] - 4:6<br/><b>defense</b> [2] - 3:6, 3:10<br/><b>Deputy</b> [1] - 2:10<br/><b>dismiss</b> [3] - 3:17, 3:25, 4:1<br/><b>dismissed</b> [1] - 3:8</p> | <p><b>DISTRICT</b> [3] - 1:1, 1:1, 1:10</p> <p><b>E</b></p> <p><b>Eisenhower</b> [1] - 1:14<br/><b>Elie</b> [2] - 3:22<br/><b>ELIE</b> [1] - 3:23<br/><b>entitled</b> [1] - 4:21<br/><b>ESQUIRE</b> [4] - 1:13, 1:17, 2:3, 2:8</p> <p><b>F</b></p> <p><b>far</b> [1] - 4:2<br/><b>February</b> [3] - 1:8, 3:6, 4:24<br/><b>FLOM</b> [1] - 1:16<br/><b>foregoing</b> [1] - 4:20<br/><b>forward</b> [1] - 4:7<br/><b>FREEMAN</b> [1] - 1:13</p> <p><b>G</b></p> <p><b>Georgia</b> [1] - 2:4<br/><b>granted</b> [1] - 4:1<br/><b>GREENBERG</b> [1] - 2:2<br/><b>Greenberg</b> [1] - 3:10<br/><b>Greene</b> [4] - 3:8, 3:12, 3:21, 3:23<br/><b>group</b> [1] - 3:10</p> <p><b>H</b></p> <p><b>HARKINS</b> [4] - 2:3, 3:9, 4:5, 4:14<br/><b>Harkins</b> [1] - 3:10<br/><b>Healthcare</b> [1] - 1:19<br/><b>held</b> [1] - 3:1<br/><b>Honor</b> [4] - 3:9, 4:5, 4:13, 4:15<br/><b>HONORABLE</b> [1] - 1:10<br/><b>Honorable</b> [2] - 2:9, 3:1<br/><b>Huahai</b> [1] - 1:19</p> <p><b>I</b></p> <p><b>Inc</b> [2] - 2:5, 2:5<br/><b>Industries</b> [1] - 2:4</p> <p><b>J</b></p> <p><b>JERSEY</b> [1] - 1:1<br/><b>Jersey</b> [2] - 1:8, 1:14<br/><b>JESSICA</b> [1] - 1:17<br/><b>joint</b> [1] - 3:10<br/><b>JUDGE</b> [1] - 1:10<br/><b>Judge</b> [1] - 3:3<br/><b>Judicial</b> [1] - 2:9</p> | <p><b>K</b></p> <p><b>KATZ</b> [1] - 1:13<br/><b>Knudson</b> [1] - 3:19<br/><b>Kugler</b> [2] - 2:9, 3:3<br/><b>KUGLER</b> [2] - 1:10, 3:2</p> <p><b>L</b></p> <p><b>larry</b> [1] - 2:10<br/><b>Law</b> [1] - 2:9<br/><b>leaves</b> [1] - 3:21<br/><b>letter</b> [1] - 3:6<br/><b>Lewis</b> [1] - 3:16<br/><b>LIABILITY</b> [1] - 1:4<br/><b>listing</b> [1] - 3:13<br/><b>LITIGATION</b> [1] - 1:4<br/><b>LLC</b> [3] - 1:13, 1:19, 2:5<br/><b>LLP</b> [2] - 1:16, 2:2<br/><b>looking</b> [1] - 4:7<br/><b>LORETTA</b> [1] - 2:8<br/><b>Ltd</b> [2] - 1:19, 2:4</p> <p><b>M</b></p> <p><b>MacStravic</b> [1] - 2:10<br/><b>MANAGEMENT</b> [1] - 1:5<br/><b>Marie</b> [2] - 1:22, 4:23<br/><b>matter</b> [5] - 3:8, 3:12, 3:17, 4:21<br/><b>matters</b> [1] - 3:16<br/><b>MAZIE</b> [1] - 1:13<br/><b>MEAGHER</b> [1] - 1:16<br/><b>mechanical</b> [1] - 1:24<br/><b>Mitchell</b> [3] - 1:7, 1:22, 4:23<br/><b>month</b> [1] - 3:15<br/><b>motion</b> [1] - 4:6<br/><b>MR</b> [5] - 3:9, 4:4, 4:5, 4:10, 4:12<br/><b>MS</b> [1] - 4:14</p> <p><b>N</b></p> <p><b>N.W</b> [1] - 1:17<br/><b>NE</b> [1] - 2:3<br/><b>NEW</b> [1] - 1:1<br/><b>New</b> [3] - 1:8, 1:14, 1:17<br/><b>next</b> [2] - 3:14, 3:20<br/><b>nothing</b> [2] - 4:5, 4:14<br/><b>NUMBER</b> [1] - 1:3</p> <p><b>O</b></p> <p><b>Official</b> [1] - 1:22<br/><b>one</b> [2] - 3:7, 3:20<br/><b>oppose</b> [1] - 4:8<br/><b>order</b> [1] - 3:17</p> |
|--|--|--|---|

**STATES** [2] - 1:1, 1:10  
**stay** [1] - 4:7  
**stenography** [1] - 1:24  
**Steve** [1] - 3:10  
**STEVEN** [1] - 2:3  
**still** [1] - 3:8  
**Streets** [1] - 1:7  
**Suite** [1] - 2:3

**T**

**tables** [1] - 3:14  
**TELEPHONIC** [1] - 1:5  
**telephonically** [1] - 3:1  
**Teva** [2] - 2:4, 2:5  
**THE COURT** [7] - 3:3, 3:6, 3:16, 3:25, 4:6, 4:11, 4:16  
**today** [1] - 4:3  
**transcript** [2] - 1:24, 4:20  
**transcription** [1] - 1:24  
**Traurig** [1] - 3:11  
**TRAURIG** [1] - 2:2

**U**

**U.S** [2] - 1:7, 1:19  
**UNITED** [2] - 1:1, 1:10  
**USA** [1] - 2:5

**V**

**VALSARTAN** [1] - 1:4

**W**

**Washington** [1] - 1:18  
**weeks** [1] - 4:17  
**Willis** [1] - 3:16

**Y**

**York** [1] - 1:17

**Z**

**Zhejiang** [1] - 1:19